

# राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग एवं अवसंरचना विकास निगम लिमिटेड

सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार  
तीसरी मंजिल, पीटीआई बिल्डिंग, 4-संसद मार्ग, नई दिल्ली 110001

## National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Limited

Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Govt. of India  
3rd Floor, PTI Building, 4-Parliament Street, New Delhi-110001, +91 11 2346 1600, www.nhidcl.com



BHARATMALA  
ROAD TO PROSPERITY



BUILDING INFRASTRUCTURE - BUILDING THE NATION

CIN: U45400DL2014GOI269062

सार्वजनिक क्षेत्र का उपक्रम

A PUBLIC SECTOR UNDERTAKING

NHIDCL/J&K/DPR-3/2018 / 632

03.06.2020

To,

M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. –RITES Ltd. (JV) Email : <a href="mailto:acquisition@geoconsult.co.in">acquisition@geoconsult.co.in</a> <a href="mailto:sayeed.anjum@geoconsult.co.in">sayeed.anjum@geoconsult.co.in</a>	M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS Email: <a href="mailto:ec-4@tec-4.es">ec-4@tec-4.es</a> , <a href="mailto:anandjiwalainfra@gmail.com">anandjiwalainfra@gmail.com</a>
M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L. Email: <a href="mailto:vseghal@eptisa.com">vseghal@eptisa.com</a>	M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. –SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd. Email: <a href="mailto:sushil.Kumar@smec.com">sushil.Kumar@smec.com</a>
M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Space Engg. Consortium Pvt. Ltd. Email: <a href="mailto:jbundela@subterra-ing.com">jbundela@subterra-ing.com</a>	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. Email: <a href="mailto:maria.palacio@tpfingenieria.com">maria.palacio@tpfingenieria.com</a>
M/s ERKAAS and Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt Ltd. (JV) in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd. Email: <a href="mailto:dp.singh@tumas.com.tr">dp.singh@tumas.com.tr</a>	

**Subject:** Consultancy Services for Preparation of Detailed Project Report and providing Pre-Construction activities for Construction of Highway Tunnel including approaches across Shinkun La, Tanglang La & Lachalung La in the Union Territory of Ladakh - **Technical Evaluation Result -reg.**

**Ref:** Your Bid dated 18.05.2020.

Sir,

Please refer to your proposal for the project cited above. In this regard first and second stage evaluation result is as under:

Sr. no	Name of the Firm	Technical Score	Status of Eligibility
(i)	M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. –RITES Ltd. (JV)	82.55	Eligible
(ii)	M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS.	91.18	Eligible
(iii)	M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.	79.41	Eligible

(iv)	M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. –SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.	79.37	Eligible
(v)	M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Space Engg. Consortium Pvt. Ltd.	79.01	Eligible
(vi)	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L.	84.86	Eligible
(vii)	M/s ERKAAS and Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt Ltd. (JV) in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd.	73.27	Eligible

2. The Financial bids of the eligible bidders shall be opened on 04.06.2020 at 1100 hrs.

(B. Shivprasad)  
General Manager (Tech.)

Encl: Detailed Evaluation.

**National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Limited**  
**(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Government of India)**

**Date:** 03.06.2020 (1600 Hrs)

**Venue:** PTI Building, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Conference Hall, NHIDCL HQ, New Delhi.

**Subject:** Consultancy Services for Preparation of Detailed Project Report and providing Pre-Construction activities for Construction of Highway Tunnel including approaches across Shinkun La, Tanglang La & Lachalung La in the Union Territory of Ladakh.

1. First stage evaluation of the seven firms was carried out on 21.05.2020 at 1500 hrs (MoM are attached as **Annexure-I**). Second stage evaluation of the six firms which had qualified in the first stage was carried out on 22.05.2020 (MoM is attached as **Annexure-II**). The scores of the firms in the second stage evaluation were uploaded on the website and the bidders were given an opportunity to respond by 27.05.2020 upto 1500 hrs. Thereafter, the financial bids were planned to be opened on 29.05.2020 at 1100 hrs.

2. Representations were received from the following within the stipulated time-frame:-

- (a) Representation dated 24.05.2020 from M/s ERKAAS and Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt. Ltd. (JV) in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd. which had been declared non responsive in the first stage of technical evaluation dt. 23.05.2020.
- (b) M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS dt. 25.05.2020.
- (c) Three representations from M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd dt. 26.05.2020, 27.05.2020 and 29.05.2020.
- (d) Representation from M/s SUBTERRA Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. dt. 29.05.2020.
- (e) Representation from M/s EPTISA India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L. dt. 24.05.2020.

3. Detailed reply to the representation from M/s ERKAAS and Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt. Ltd. (JV) in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd. mentioned under Para 2(a) above was forwarded by this office vide letter No. NHIDCL/J&K/DPR-3/2018/604 dt. 28.05.2020. The firm was requested to submit their response if any, by 29.05.2020 upto 2000 hrs. Accordingly, the firm submitted its reply vide their letter No ER-TU/NHIDCL/2020/DPR/Tunnel/04 dt. 29.05.2020. It is to be mentioned that M/s ERKAS and Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt. Ltd. (JV) in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd. submitted their bid with 2 JV partners, which is why the firm was declared non-responsive during the earlier evaluation process. However, vide their representation, had intimated that out of the two firms, one is in JV and the other is a parent company of the Indian Firm. A JV Agreement between M/s ERKAS and TUMAS India was also submitted along with the bid. Hence, ETEC considered the firm as responsive and the bid was further evaluated as per the 2<sup>nd</sup> stage evaluation process. Further, the committee examined the reply of M/s ERKAS JV with



reference to experience in Directional Coring and found that the same is not satisfactory and decided not to consider these projects in evaluation.

4. Similarly, the representations of M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS and M/s SMEC International - SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd. and reply of M/s SUBTERRA Engineering Pvt. Ltd. . in association with Space Engg. Consortium Pvt. Ltd., with reference to the clarifications raised vide this office letter dated 28.05.2020 was examined by the Committee.

5. In view of the above, a thorough examination of Technical evaluation for all the Key Personnel and firms was carried out. Summary of the final technical evaluation is covered in succeeding paras.

#### 5.1 Relevant experience for assignments :-

The marks obtained by firms towards relevant experience for assignments are enclosed as **Annexure-III** and marks obtained are given below:

5.1.1 On examining the representation of M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS., it has been observed that (i) Earlier under Sr. No. 3, even though 3 projects were listed, marks for only 2 projects were given. The same has been corrected and (ii) Earlier under Sr. no. 4, 1 project of DEVICO at Sr no. 4 of INFRACON was not considered. The same has now been considered.

5.1.2 On examining the representation of M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. -SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd., it has been observed that the bidder is claiming for projects where Supervision and Feasibility were carried out whereas the requirement was of DPR only. Hence, there is no change in the earlier evaluation.

5.1.3 On examining the representation of M/s EPTISA India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L, it has been observed that the bidder is claiming for projects where Supervision and Feasibility were carried out whereas the requirement was of DPR only. Hence, there is no change in the earlier evaluation.

Sr. No.	Name of the firm	Maximum Marks	Earlier published marks	Revised Marks obtained
1.	M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. -RITES Ltd. (JV)	40	30	30
2.	M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS.		35	39
3.	M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.		28	28
4.	M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. -SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.		26	26
5.	M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Space Engg. Consortium Pvt. Ltd.		29.5	29.5
6.	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L.		30	30
7.	M/s ERKAAS and Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt Ltd. (JV) in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd.		-	22



## 5.2 Material Testing Survey and Investigation Equipment and Software proposed to be used:

The marks obtained by the firms towards Material Testing Survey and Investigation Equipment and Software proposed for assignments are enclosed as **Annexure-IV** and marks obtained are given below:

Sr. No.	Name of the firm	Maximum Marks	Marks obtained
1.	M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. –RITES Ltd. (JV)	10	9.75
2.	M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS.		10
3.	M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.		9.5
4.	M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. –SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.		9.75
5.	M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Space Engg. Consortium Pvt. Ltd.		8.75
6.	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L.		9.5
7.	M/s ERKAAS and Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt Ltd. (JV) in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd.		8.75

## 5.3 Qualifications and relevant experience of the proposed key personnel

The experience of the key personnel of firms towards Qualifications and Relevant Experience of the Assignments proposed were re-evaluated / re-considered based on the representations by the bidders and the revised marks obtained vis-à-vis the earlier published marks are given below. The details of the same is annexed at **Annexure-V**:

### (i) M/s GeoConsult India Pvt. Ltd. In JV with RITES Ltd.

S. No.	Position	Total marks	GeoConsult India Pvt. Ltd. In JV with RITES Ltd.		
			Name	Earlier published marks	Revised Marks
1	Team Leader cum Senior Tunnel Expert	12	Lalit Kumar	10.92	11.04
2	Tunnel Design Expert	10	Florian Krenn	8.90	8.60
3	Sr. Ventilation & Fire Safety Expert	8	Bernhard Happerger	6.96	6.96
4	Senior Geotechnical Expert	10	Ravindra Dutta	8.00	8.60
5	Directional Coring Expert	10	Subrata Kumar	9.20	7.60
	Total	50		43.98	42.80

### (ii) M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in Association with AIA & Devico AS.

S. No.	Position	Total marks	Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in Association with AIA & Devico AS		
			Name	Earlier published marks	Revised Marks
1	Team Leader cum Senior Tunnel Expert	12	Francisco Javier Castanedo	11.40	11.28
2	Tunnel Design Expert	10	Diana Castanedo	7.40	6.90
3	Sr. Ventilation & Fire Safety Expert	8	Francisco Antonio Avazques Buceta	7.60	8.00

4	Senior Geotechnical Expert	10	Fleix Maria Lasheras Albert	9.00	7.50
5	Directional Coring Expert	10	Chris Wai Kay Tai	9.50	8.50
	<b>Total</b>	<b>50</b>		<b>44.90</b>	<b>42.18</b>

(iii) M/s Eptisa India Pvt Ltd in Association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.

S. No.	Position	Total marks	Eptisa India Pvt Ltd in Association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.		
			Name	Earlier published marks	Revised Marks
1	Team Leader cum Senior Tunnel Expert	12	Ram Bachan Shivali	10.32	9.00
2	Tunnel Design Expert	10	Dr. Jorg Holzhuser	9.30	7.90
3	Sr. Ventilation & Fire Safety Expert	8	Alexander Rudolf	7.36	7.36
4	Senior Geotechnical Expert	10	Sindu Kumar Bagati	9.00	7.80
5	Directional Coring Expert	10	Arindom Ganguly	9.45	9.85
	<b>Total</b>	<b>50</b>		<b>45.43</b>	<b>41.91</b>

(iv) M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. in JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.

S. No.	Position	Total marks	SMEC International Pty. Ltd. in JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.		
			Name	Earlier published marks	Revised Marks
1	Team Leader cum Senior Tunnel Expert	12	Ulrich Peter Rehm	11.16	11.28
2	Tunnel Design Expert	10	B R Sharma	8.70	7.90
3	Sr. Ventilation & Fire Safety Expert	8	Robert W Dunlop	7.44	7.44
4	Senior Geotechnical Expert	10	Aurelio Arespacochaga Arangena	8.00	8.00
5	Directional Coring Expert	10	Eirik Borg	9.00	9.00
	<b>Total</b>	<b>50</b>		<b>44.30</b>	<b>43.62</b>

(v) M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt Ltd. in Association with Space Engineers Consortium Pvt. Ltd.

S. No.	Position	Total marks	Subterra Engineering India Pvt Ltd. in Association with Space Engineers Consortium Pvt Ltd.		
			Name	Earlier published marks	Revised Marks
1	Team Leader cum Senior Tunnel Expert	12	Abolghasem Parpinchi	11.16	11.28
2	Tunnel Design Expert	10	Francisco Jose Gracia Pro	9.00	9.00
3	Sr. Ventilation & Fire Safety Expert	8	Bhanoo P. Verma	7.60	6.48
4	Senior Geotechnical Expert	10	Majid Sarrami	9.00	8.60
5	Directional Coring Expert	10	Sheikh Abdul Ahad	6.50	5.4
	<b>Total</b>	<b>50</b>		<b>43.26</b>	<b>40.76</b>



(vi) M/s TPF Getinsa Eurostudios S.L.

S. No.	Position	Total marks	TPF Getinsa Eurostudios S.L.		
			Name	Earlier published marks	Revised Marks
1	Team Leader cum Senior Tunnel Expert	12	Yousef Eshaghpour Rahimabadi	11.40	11.40
2	Tunnel Design Expert	10	Hamed Moammeri Otorabad	8.60	8.80
3	Sr. Ventilation & Fire Safety Expert	8	Sunit Kanti Dhar	7.20	6.96
4	Senior Geotechnical Expert	10	Joan Santamaria Casanovas	8.90	8.70
5	Directional Coring Expert	10	Christian Alejandro Monardez Arancibia	9.50	9.50
	<b>Total</b>	<b>50</b>		<b>45.60</b>	<b>45.36</b>

(vii) M/s ERKAS- Turkish Engg Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS in association with AVOK.

S. No.	Position	Total marks	ERKAS- Turkish Engg Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS in association with AVOK	
			Name	Marks
1	Team Leader cum Senior Tunnel Expert	12	Nail Unlu	11.04
2	Tunnel Design Expert	10	Turker Arzu	9.30
3	Sr. Ventilation & Fire Safety Expert	8	Lebipahmet Byukeren	6.08
4	Senior Geotechnical Expert	10	Cine Salih	9.50
5	Directional Coring Expert	10	Neslihan Ozefe	6.60
	<b>Total</b>	<b>50</b>		<b>42.52</b>

6. The final technical scores (Annexure-VI) are worked out as under:

Summary of evaluation of Technical Proposals						Remarks
S. No.		Relevant experience for assignments	Material Testing S&I Equipment and Software	Qualifications & competence of the key personnel	Total marks	
	<b>Maximum Mark</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>100</b>	
1	M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. – RITES Ltd. (JV)	30	9.75	42.80	82.55	Eligible for opening of financial proposal
2	M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS.	39	10	42.18	91.18	Eligible for opening of financial proposal
3	M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.	28	9.5	41.91	79.41	Eligible for opening of financial proposal
4	M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. –SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.	26	9.75	43.62	79.37	Eligible for opening of financial proposal
5	M/s Subterra Engg. India Pvt. Ltd. in ass. with Space Engg. Consortium Pvt. Ltd.	29.5	8.75	40.76	79.01	Eligible for opening of financial proposal



Summary of evaluation of Technical Proposals						Remarks
S. No.		Relevant experience for assignments	Material Testing S&I Equipment and Software	Qualifications & competence of the key personnel	Total marks	
	Maximum Mark	40	10	50	100	
6	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L.	30	9.5	45.36	84.86	Eligible for opening of financial proposal
7.	M/s ERKAAS and Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt Ltd. (JV) in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd.	22	8.75	42.52	73.27	Eligible for opening of financial proposal

7. In view of the above, ETEC recommended that the following firms qualify for the Financial Bid Opening:

- M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. –RITES Ltd. (JV)
- M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS.
- M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.
- M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. –SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.
- M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Space Engg. Consortium Pvt. Ltd.
- M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L.
- M/s ERKAAS and Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt Ltd. (JV) in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd

8. The ETEC thus, recommended the following:-

- Scores of the firms in the final evaluation as brought out in Para 6 above be made available on the website.
- The Financial Bids may be opened on 04.06.2020 at 1100 Hrs with the approval of the Competent Authority.

Meeting ended with vote of thanks to the Chair.

9. There is no representation in respect of honour. There are no comments from the finance.

Sh. Mahesh Gupta  
DGM (Fin.)  
(Member)

Sh. B. Shrivastava  
GM (Tech.)  
(Member Secretary)

Sh. A.K. Jha  
DGM (Tech.)  
(Member)

Sh. Sanjeev Malik  
Executive Director-III  
(Convener)

**National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Limited**  
**(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Government of India)**

Date: 21.05.2020 (1500 Hrs)

Venue: PTI Building, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Conference Hall, NHIDCL HQ, New Delhi.

1<sup>st</sup> Minutes of Meeting of Empowered Technical Bid Evaluation Committee (ETEC) for "Consultancy Services for Preparation of Detailed Project Report and providing Pre-Construction activities for Construction of Highway Tunnel including approaches across Shinkun La, Tanglang La & Lachalung La in the Union Territory of Ladakh".

The following firms had submitted their bids on the CPP Portal by due date and time.

Sl. No.	Name of Firm
1.	M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. -RITES Ltd. (JV)
2.	M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with Anandjiwala Technical consultancy and in association with Anandjiwala Infra Advisory and Devico AS.
3.	M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.
4.	M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. -SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.
5.	M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Space Engineering Consortium Pvt. Ltd.
6.	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L.
7.	M/s ERKAAS and Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt Ltd. (JV) in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd.

2. Having opened the Technical bids on 19.05.2020, the Committee (ETEC) met on 21.05.2020 to undertake the 1<sup>st</sup> Stage Evaluation in accordance with the provisions of RFP and noted the following:

- (i) As per para 1.4 of LOI the technical proposal were to be received through Infracon by making it mandatory for firms and personnel to register on the portal.
- (ii) The committee further noted that as per clause 1.4 of LOI, the consultant shall submits proposal either in sole capacity or in JV or in association. Also JV shall not have more than 2 firms.
- (iii) As per clause 2.2 the proposal shall be received through Infracon and the consultant should upload the proposal using the Infracon portal and procedure prescribed in it.
- (iv) It was informed by the technical division that being the consultancy services for preparation of Tunnel DPR the proposal submitted through INFRACON needs to be evaluated manually.

### 3. First Stage Evaluation:

3.1 The Committee noted the requirements of documents in support of proof of eligibility as per clause 3.1 of Letter of Invitation. The ETEC carried out further evaluation in terms of proof of eligibility and the detailed evaluation is attached at **Annexure-I**. The evaluation result is tabulated below:

Sl. No	Details of documents to be submitted online	Name of Bidders						
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7
		M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. - RITES Ltd. (JV)	M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with Anandjiwala Technical consultancy and in association with Anandjiwala Infra Advisory and Devico AS.	M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.	M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. - SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Space Engineering Consortium Pvt. Ltd.	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L.	M/s ERKAAS and Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting -TUMAS India Pvt Ltd. (JV) in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd.
1.	The proposal is accompanied by Document fee	Yes Received	Yes Received	Yes Received	Yes Received	Yes Received	Yes Received	Yes Received
2.	The Proposal is accompanied by Bid Security of required value	Yes Received	Yes Received	Yes Received	Yes Received	Yes Received	Yes Received	Yes Received
3.	The firms(s) have required experience (Evaluation sheet at Annexure-I)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4.	The firms(s) have required turnover (Evaluation sheet at Annexure-I)	Yes ✓	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes ✓	Yes
5.	The documents are properly signed by the authorized signatories and whether the proposal contains proper POA as mentioned at para 1.8.1 above	Yes (scan copy)	Yes (Scan Copy)	Yes (Scan Copy)	Yes (Scan Copy)	Yes (Scan Copy)	Yes (Scan Copy)	Yes (Scan Copy)
6.	The proposals have been received on or before the dead line of submission.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
7.	In case a Joint Venture/Association of firms, the proposal shall be accompanied by a certified copy of legally binding Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) on a stamp paper of Rs. 100, signed by all firms to the joint venture/Association as detailed at para 1.8.2 above	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	(Yes)	Yes. However, it has been observed that there are more than two JV partners on INFRACON due to which the applicant has been declared non – responsive.

No UDIN on  
CA certificate  
turnover

No UDIN

Annual Report  
on 31/03/2017 is available  
on website of the company



3.2 M/s ERKAAS and Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt Ltd. (JV) in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd.


The proposal was examined and As per clause 1.4 of LOI - *The consultants shall submit proposals either in sole capacity or in JV and/or in Association. Joint Venture shall not have more than two firms. It was observed from the Joint Venture agreement submitted alongwith technical proposal that the bidder has JV of two firms namely M/s Era-as and M/s Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt Ltd. However, they have made Joint Venture of three firm on INFRACON namely M/s ERKAAS, M/s. TUMAS and M/s Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt Ltd. in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd. which is against the RFP criteria of maximum 2 firms in JV and hence, declared non-responsive.*


4. The Committee after due deliberation recommended that the following responsive firms are eligible for the second stage of bid evaluation:


S. No.	Name of the Applicants	Eligibility
1.	M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. -RITES Ltd. (JV)	Responsive
2.	M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with Anandjiwala Technical consultancy and in association with Anandjiwala Infra Advisory and Devico AS.	Responsive
3.	M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.	Responsive
4.	M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. -SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.	Responsive
5.	M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Space Engineering Consortium Pvt. Ltd.	Responsive
6.	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L.	Responsive
7.	M/s ERKAAS and Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt Ltd. (JV) in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd.	Non-Responsive

Meeting ended with vote of thanks to the Chair.

  
Sh. Mahesh Gupta  
DGM (Fin.)  
(Member)

  
Sh. B. Shivprasad  
GM (Tech.)  
(Member Secretary)

  
Sh. A.K. Jha  
DGM (Tech.)  
(Member)

  
Sh. Sanjeev Malik  
Executive Director-III  
(Convener)

**National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Limited**  
**(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Government of India)**

Date: 22.05.2020 (1500 Hrs)

Venue: PTI Building, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Conference Hall, NHIDCL HQ, New Delhi.

**Subject: Consultancy Services for Preparation of Detailed Project Report and providing Pre-Construction activities for Construction of Highway Tunnel including approaches across Shinkun La, Tanglang La & Lachalung La in the Union Territory of Ladakh - Second Stage Evaluation.**

The following seven firms submitted their bids online through INFRACON and CPP Portal for the subject project by due date and time.

Sl. No.	Name of Firm
1.	M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. -RITES Ltd. (JV)
2.	M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with Anandjiwala Technical consultancy and in association with Anandjiwala Infra Advisory and Devico AS.
3.	M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.
4.	M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. -SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.
5.	M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Space Engineering Consortium Pvt. Ltd.
6.	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L.
7.	M/s ERKAAS and Turkish Engineering Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS India Pvt Ltd. (JV) in association with AVOK Engineering Consulting & Contracting Pvt. Ltd.

2. The Committee met on 21.05.2020 to finalize the 1<sup>st</sup> stage evaluation (MOM attached as **Annexure-I**). The following firms had qualified for Second Stage Evaluation i.e. Technical Evaluation:

Sl. No.	Name of Firm
1.	M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. -RITES Ltd. (JV)
2.	M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS.
3.	M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.
4.	M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. -SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.
5.	M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Space Engg. Consortium Pvt. Ltd.
6.	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L.

3. The second stage evaluation of the above mentioned qualified firms were carried out. The key points observed during second stage evaluation are summed up as follows:

### 3.1 Relevant experience for assignments:-

The marks obtained by the firms towards relevant experience for assignments are enclosed as Annexure-II and marks obtained are given below:

Sr. No.	Name of the firm	Maximum Marks	Marks obtained
1.	M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. –RITES Ltd. (JV)	40	30
2.	M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS.		35
3.	M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.		28
4.	M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. –SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.		26
5.	M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Space Engg. Consortium Pvt. Ltd.		29.5
6.	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L.		30

### 3.2 Material Testing Survey and Investigation Equipment and Software proposed to be used:

The marks obtained by the firms towards Material Testing Survey and Investigation Equipment and Software proposed for assignments are enclosed as Annexure-III and marks obtained are given below:

Sr. No.	Name of the firm	Maximum Marks	Marks obtained
1.	M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. –RITES Ltd. (JV)	10	9.75
2.	M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS.		10
3.	M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.		9.5
4.	M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. –SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.		9.75
5.	M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Space Engg. Consortium Pvt. Ltd.		8.75
6.	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L.		9.5

### 3.3 Qualifications and relevant experience of the proposed key personnel

The marks obtained by the key personnel of the firms towards Qualifications and Relevant experience of the proposed for assignments are enclosed as Annexure-IV and marks obtained are given below:



Position	Total marks	1		2		3	
		M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. – RITES Ltd. (JV).		M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS		M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.	
		Name	Marks	Name	Marks	Name	Marks
Team Leader cum Sr. Tunnel expert	12	Lalit Kumar	10.92	Francisco Javier Castanedo	11.40	Ram Bachan Shivali	10.32
Tunnel Design Expert	10	Florian Krenn	8.90	Diana Castanedo	7.40	Dr. Jorg Holzhuser	9.30
Sr. Ventilation & Fire Safety Expert	8	Bernhard happerger	6.96	Francisco Antonio AVazques Buceta	7.60	Alexander Rudolf	7.36
Sr. Geotechnical Expert	10	Ravindra Dutta	8.00	Fleix Maria Lasheras Albert	9.00	Sindu Kumar Bagati	9.00
Directional Coring Expert	10	Subrata Kumar	9.20	Chris Wai Kay Tai	9.50	Arindom Ganguly	9.45
Total	50		43.98		44.90		45.43

Position	Total marks	4		5		6	
		M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. – SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd...		M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Space Engg. Consortium Pvt. Ltd..		M/s TPF Getinsa Eurostudios S.L.	
		Name	Marks	Name	Marks	Name	Marks
Team Leader cum Sr. Tunnel expert	12	Ulrich Peter Rehm	11.16	Abolghasem Parpinchi	11.16	Yousef Eshaghpour Rahimabadi	11.40
Tunnel Design Expert	10	B R Sharma	8.70	Francisco Jose Gracia Pro	9.00	Hamed Moammeri Otorabad	8.60
Sr. Ventilation & Fire Safety Expert	8	Rovert W Dunlop	7.44	Bhanoo P. Verma	7.60	Sunit Kanti Dhar	7.20
Sr. Geotechnical Expert	10	Aurelio Arespacocha ga Arangena	8.00	Majid Sarrami	9.00	Joan Santamaria Casanovas	8.90
Directional Coring Expert	10	Eirik Borg	9.00	Sheikh Abdul Ahad	6.50	Christian Alejandro Monardez Arancibia	9.50
Total	50		44.30		43.26		45.60

*Agh*

*intad*

*Shy*

*Brite*

5. The final technical scores (Annexure-V) were worked out as under:

Summary of evaluation of Technical Proposals						Remarks
S. No.		Relevant experience for assignments	Material Testing S&I Equipment and Software	Qualifications & competence of the key personnel	Total marks	
	Maximum Mark	40	10	50	100	
1	M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. -RITES Ltd. (JV)	30	9.75	43.98	83.73	Eligible for opening of financial proposal
2	M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS.	35	10	44.90	89.90	Eligible for opening of financial proposal
3	M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.	28	9.5	45.43	82.93	Eligible for opening of financial proposal
4	M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. -SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.	26	9.75	44.30	80.05	Eligible for opening of financial proposal
5	M/s Subterra Engg. India Pvt. Ltd. in ass. with Space Engg. Consortium Pvt. Ltd.	29.5	8.75	43.26	81.51	Eligible for opening of financial proposal
6	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L.	30	9.5	45.60	85.10	Eligible for opening of financial proposal

6. In view of the above, ETEC recommended that the following firms qualify for the Financial Bid Opening:

1. M/s Geo Consult India Pvt. Ltd. -RITES Ltd. (JV)
2. M/s Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in association with AIA and Devico AS.
3. M/s Eptisa India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.
4. M/s SMEC International Pty. Ltd. -SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.
5. M/s Subterra Engineering India Pvt. Ltd. in association with Space Engg. Consortium Pvt. Ltd.
6. M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L.

7. The ETEC, thus, recommended that

- i) The scores of the firms towards second stage evaluation as brought out in the para 5 above the list of the technically qualified bidders be made available on the website giving opportunity to the bidders to respond.
- ii) The Financial Bids may be opened subsequently with the approval of the Competent Authority.

*Finance Division has evaluated only turnover and related points.*

Meeting ended with vote of thanks to the Chair.



Sh. Mahesh Gupta  
DGM (Fin.)  
(Member)



Sh. B. Shivprasad  
GM (Tech.)  
(Member Secretary)



Sh. A.K. Jha  
DGM (Tech.)  
(Member)



Sh. Sanjeev Malik  
Executive Director-III  
(Convener)



Project Name : Consultancy Services for Preparation of Detailed Project Report and providing Pre-Construction activities for Construction of Highway Tunnel including approaches across Shinkun La, Tanglang La & Lachalung La in the Union Territory of Ladakh

Evaluation for assesment of experience of the firms (Relevant experience of firm for assignment)

S. No.	Description	Maximum marks	GeoConsult India Pvt. Ltd. In JV with RITES Ltd.	Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in Association with AIA & Devico AS	Eptisa India Pvt Ltd in Association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.	SMEC International Pty. Ltd. in JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.	Subterra Engineering India Pvt Ltd. in Association with Space Engineers Consortium Pvt Ltd.	TPF Getinsa Eurostudios S.L.	ERKAS- Turkish Engg Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS in association with AVOK
			Details	Details	Details	Details	Details	Details	Details
1.1	Aggregate length of DPR/Feasibility study of Road/Rail/Metro Tunnel projects		Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI No. 6 : (0.75*10200 m) = 7650 m DPR SI no. 8 : (1*8450 m) = 8450 m DPR SI no. 10 : (1*13210 m) = 13210 m DPR (29310 m)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI No. 2 : (1*3000 m) = 3000 m DPR SI no. 3 : (1*2226 m) = 2226 m DPR SI no. 4 : (1*425 m) = 425 m DPR SI no. 5 : (1*5680 m) = 5680 m DPR SI no. 6 : (0.5*23000 m) = 11500 m FS SI no. 7 : (1*988 m) = 988 m DPR (23819 m)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI No. 30 : (1*7310 m) = 7310 m DPR SI no. 44 : (1*630 m) = 630 m DPR SI no. 51 : (1*6656 m) = 6656 m DPR SI no. 61 : (1*6150 m) = 6150 m DPR (0.75*10000 m) = 7500 m FS SI no. 78 : (1*2500 m) = 2500 m FS (33371m)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI No. 49 : (0.75*10000 m) = 7500 m FS SI no. 57 : (0.75*2100 m) = 1574 m DPR SI no. 65 : (1*8500 m) = 8500 m FS SI no. 70 : (0.5*9000 m) = 4500 m DPR SI no. 79 : (1*6500 m) = 6500 m FS (21074m)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI No. 3 : (1*5250 m) = 5250 m DPR SI no. 6 : (1*15292 m) = 15292 m DPR SI no. 7 : (1*3000 m) = 3000 m DPR SI no. 11 : (1*5650 m) = 5650 m FS SI no. 13 : (0.75*22000 m) = 16500 m DPR SI no. 14 : (1*1916 m) = 1916 m DPR (47608 m)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI No. 36 : (0.75*3897 m) = 2923 m DPR SI no. 52 : (1*2180 m) = 2180 m DPR SI no. 107 : (1*12600 m) = 12600 m DPR SI no. 132 : (1*8000 m) = 8000 m DPR SI no. 132 : (1*10000 m) = 10000 m DPR (35703 m)	Project Sr nos. as on INFRACON (ERKA) SI no. 5 : (0.5*12936 m) = 6468 m DPR Project Sr nos. as on INFRACON (TUMAS) SI no. 1 : (1*3774 m) = 3774 m DPR (10242 m)
1.1.1	More than the indicative length - 6 Marks	8							
1.1.2	More than 1.5 times the indicative length - 7 Marks								
1.1.3	More than 2 times the indicative length - 8 Marks								
1.2	DPR of Road/Rail/Metro Tunnel projects each equal to or more than 40% of indicative tunnel length (or Feasibility Study for Road/Rail/Metro tunnel project each equal to or more than 60% of indicative tunnel length)	7	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI No. 6 : (0.75*10200 m) = 7650 m DPR SI no. 8 : (1*8450 m) = 8450 m DPR SI no. 10 : (1*13210 m) = 13210 m DPR (3 Projects)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI no. 5 : (1*5680 m) = 5680 m DPR SI no. 6 : (0.5*23000 m) = 11500 m FS (2 Projects)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI No. 30 : (1*7310 m) = 7310 m DPR SI no. 51 : (1*6656 m) = 6656 m DPR SI no. 61 : (1*6150 m) = 6150 m DPR (0.75*10000 m) = 7500 m FS (4 Projects)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI no. 65 : (1*8500 m) = 8500 m DPR SI no. 70 : (0.5*9000 m) = 4500 m DPR SI no. 79 : (1*6500 m) = 6500 m DPR (3 Projects)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI No. 3 : (1*5250 m) = 5250 m DPR SI no. 6 : (1*15292 m) = 15292 m DPR SI no. 11 : (1*5650 m) = 56500 m FS SI no. 13 : (0.75*22000 m) = 16500 m DPR (4 Projects)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI no. 107 : (1*12600 m) = 12600 m DPR SI no. 132 : (1*8000 m) = 8000 m DPR SI no. 132 : (1*10000 m) = 10000 m DPR (3 Projects)	Project Sr nos. as on INFRACON (ERKA) SI no. 5 : (0.5*12880 m) = 6440 m DPR (1 Project)
1.2.1	1 Projects - 5 Marks								
1.2.2	2 projects - 6 marks								
1.2.3	3 or more projects - 7 marks								
2	Specific experience of firms in terms of turnover								
2.1	Firm Average Turnover of last 5 years >= 50 crore	5	Rs 16.876 Crore - Geo Consult Rs 1553.40 Crore - RITES	Rs 98.98 Crore	Rs 823.17 Crore	Rs 1606.45 Crore	Rs 29.578 Crore	Rs 280.54 Crore	Rs 280.54 Crore
2.2	Firm Av. Turnover of last 5 years >= 20 crore but < 50 crore								
2.3	Firm's Average Turnover of last 5 years < 20 crore								
3	DPR for Road/Rail/Metro Tunnel projects in Hills or at an elevation of more than 1000 m	10	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI No. 6 : (0.75*10200 m) = 7650 m DPR SI no. 8 : (1*8450 m) = 8450 m DPR SI no. 10 : (1*13210 m) = 13210 m DPR (3 Projects)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI No. 2 : (1*3000 m) = 3000 m DPR SI no. 3 : (1*2226 m) = 2226 m DPR SI no. 4 : (1*425 m) = 425 m DPR (3 Projects)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI No. 30 : (1*7310 m) = 7310 m DPR SI no. 44 : (1*630 m) = 630 m DPR (2 Projects)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI no. 70 : (0.5*9000 m) = 4500 m DPR (1 Project)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI No. 3 : (1*5250 m) = 5250 m DPR SI no. 6 : (1*15292 m) = 15292 m DPR SI no. 7 : (1*3000 m) = 3000 m DPR (3 Projects)	Project serial nos. as on INFRACON SI no. 107 : (1*12600 m) = 12600 m DPR SI no. 132 : (1*8000 m) = 8000 m DPR SI no. 132 : (1*10000 m) = 10000 m DPR (3 Projects)	Project Sr nos. as on INFRACON (ERKA) SI no. 5 : (0.5*12936 m) = 6448 m DPR
3.1	1 Projects - 6 Marks								
3.2	2 projects - 8 marks								
3.3	3 or more projects - 10 marks								
3	Carried out Airborne Electromagnetic Survey (AEM) (non-intrusive geophysical survey) to the depth of 300 M and have successfully prepared interpretative engineering geological model using the data so obtained	10		Devico's Project Sr. No. as on INFRACON SI No. 1 : L= 960 m, D= 390m SI No. 2 : L= 1650 m, D= 360m SI No. 4 : L= 1200 m, D= 235m (3 Projects)					
	OR								
	Directional Coring for investigating preparing record of ground conditions and geological information for a minimum horizontal length of 500M at a depth of 200M of more from ground surface								
4.1	1 Tunnel / project - 6 Marks								
4.2	2 Tunnels / projects - 8 Marks								
4.3	3 Tunnels / projects or more - 10 Marks								
Total		40	30	39	28	26	29.5	30	22

Project Name : Consultancy Services for Preparation of Detailed Project Report and providing Pre-Construction activities for Construction of Highway Tunnel including approaches across Shinkun La, Tanglang La & Lachalung La in the Union Territory of Ladakh

Evaluation for assesment of Material Testing Survey and Investigation Equipment and Software

S. No.	Description	Maximum marks	Sub- Points	GeoConsult India Pvt. Ltd. In JV with RITES Ltd.		Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in Association with AIA & Devico AS		Eptisa India Pvt Ltd in Association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.		SMEC International Pty. Ltd. in JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.		Subterra Engineering India Pvt Ltd. in Association with Space Engineers Consortium Pvt Ltd.		TPF Getinsa Eurostudios S.L.		ERKAS- Turkish Engg Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS in association with AVOK	
				Details	Marks	Details	Marks	Details	Marks	Details	Marks	Details	Marks	Details	Marks	Details	Marks
1	Availability of in-house material testing facility	4		Available	4	Available	4	Available	4	Available	4	Outsourced	3.25	Available	4	Outsourced	3.25
1.1	Available		4														
1.2	Outsourced or through associate		3.25														
2	Field Investigation Facilities	2		Available	1	Available	1	Outsourced	0.75	Outsourced	0.75	Outsourced	0.75	Outsourced	0.75	Outsourced	0.75
2.1	(a) Geo Technical Investigation	1															
	Available		1														
	Outsourced or through associate		0.75	Outsourced	0.75	Available	1	Outsourced	0.75	Available	1	Outsourced	0.75	Outsourced	0.75	Outsourced	0.75
2.2	(b) Pavement Investigation	1															
	Available		1														
	Outsourced		0.75	Available	4	Available	4	Available	4	Available	4	Available	4	Available	4	Available	4
3	Availability of Office Equipment and Software for Tunnel Projects with persons/resources having operational skills of the equipment	4															
3.1	Available		4														
3.2	Outsourced or through associate		3.25	Total	9.75		10		9.5		9.75		8.75		9.5		8.75
	Total	10			9.75		10		9.5		9.75		8.75		9.5		8.75



**Evaluation of Technical Proposal - Summary of Key Personnel**

**Project Name : Consultancy Services for Preparation of Detailed Project Report and providing Pre-Construction activities for Construction of Highway Tunnel including approaches across Shinkun La, Tanglang La & Lachalung La in the Union Territory of Ladakh**

S. No.	Position	Total marks	1		2		3		4		5		6		7	
			GeoConsult India Pvt. Ltd. In JV with RITES Ltd.		Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in Association with AIA & Devico AS		Eptisa India Pvt Ltd in Association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.		SMEC International Pty. Ltd. in JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.		Subterra Engineering India Pvt Ltd. in Association with Space Engineers Consortium Pvt Ltd.		TPF Getinsa Eurostudios S.L.		ERKAS- Turkish Engg Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS in association with AVOK	
			Name	Marks	Name	Marks	Name	Marks	Name	Marks	Name	Marks	Name	Marks	Name	Marks
1	Team Leader cum Senior Tunnel Expert	12	Lalit Kumar	11.04	Francisco Javier Castanedo	11.28	Ram Bachan Shivali	9.00	Ulrich Peter Rehm	11.28	Abolghasem Parpinchi	11.28	Yousef Eshaghpour Rahimabadi	11.4	Nail Unlu	11.04
2	Tunnel Design Expert	10	Florian Krenn	8.6	Diana Castanedo	6.90	Dr. Jorg Holzhuser	7.90	B R Sharma	7.9	Francisco Jose Gracia Pro	9	Hamed Moammeri Otorabad	8.8	Turker Arzu	9.3
3	Sr. Ventilation & Fire Safety Expert	8	Bernhard happerger	6.96	Francisco Antonio AVazques Buceta	8.00	Alexander Rudolf	7.36	Rovert W Dunlop	7.44	Bhanoo P. Verma	6.48	Sunit Kanti Dhar	6.96	Lebipahmet Byukeren	6.08
4	Senior Geotechnical Expert	10	Ravindra Dutta	8.6	Fleix Maria Lasheras Albert	7.50	Sindu Kumar Bagati	7.80	Aurelio Arespacochaga Arangena	8	Majid Sarrami	8.6	Joan Santamaria Casanovas	8.7	Cine Salih	9.5
5	Directional Coring Expert	10	Subrata Kumar	7.6	Chris Wai Kay Tai	8.50	Arindom Ganguly	9.85	Eirik Borg	9	Sheikh Abdul Ahad	5.4	Christian Alejandro Monardez Arancibia	9.5	Neslihan Ozefe	6.6
	Total	50		42.8		42.18		41.91		43.62		40.76		45.36		42.52

*[Signature]*

*[Signature]*

*[Signature]*

*[Signature]*

Name of the Bidder →		GeoConsult India Pvt. Ltd. In JV with RITES Ltd.	Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in Association with AIA & Devico AS	Eptisa India Pvt Ltd in Association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.	SMEC International Pty. Ltd. in JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.	Subterra Engineering India Pvt Ltd. in Association with Space Engineers Consortium Pvt Ltd.	TPF Getinsa Eurostudios S.L.	ERKAS- Turkish Engg Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS in association with AVOK
Key Personals ↓	Max.Marks	Project Name : <i>Consultancy Services for Preparation of Detailed Project Report and providing Pre-Construction activities for Construction of Highway Tunnel including approaches across Shinkun La, Tanglang La &amp; Lachalung La in the Union Territory of Ladakh</i>						
Team Leader cum Senior Tunnel Expert	12	Lalit Kumar	Francisco Javier Castanedo	Ram Bachan Shivali	Ulrich Peter Rehm	Abolghasem Parpinchi	Yousef Eshaghpour Rahimabadi	Nail Unlu
Tunnel Design Expert	10	Florian Krenn	Diana Castanedo	Dr. Jorg Holzhuser	B R Sharma	Francisco Jose Gracia Pro	Hamed Moammeri Otorabad	Turker Arzu
Sr. Ventilation & Fire Safety Expert	8	Bernhard happerger	Francisco Antonio AVazques Buceta	Alexander Rudolf	Rovert W Dunlop	Bhanoo P. Verma	Sunit Kanti Dhar	Lebipahmet Byukeren
Senior Geotechnical Expert	10	Ravindra Dutta	Fleix Maria Lasheras Albert	Sindu Kumar Bagati	Aurelio Arespacochaga Arangena	Majid Sarrami	Joan Santamaria Casanovas	Cine Salih
Directional Coring Expert	10	Subrata Kumar	Chris Wai Kay Tai	Arindom Ganguly	Eirik Borg	Sheikh Abdul Ahad	Christian Alejandro Monardez Arancibia	Neslihan Ozefer

\*





## Tunnel Design Exper

Sr. No.	Name of the Bidder →		GeoConsult India Pvt. Ltd. In JV with RITES Ltd.				Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in Association with AIA & Devico AS				Eptisa India Pvt Ltd in Association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.				SMEC International Pty. Ltd. in JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.				Subterra Engineering India Pvt Ltd. in Association with Space Engineers Consortium Pvt Ltd.				TPF Getinsa Eurostudios S.L.				ERKAS- Turkish Engg Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS in association with AVOK		
	Name of the KEY PERSONAL →		Florian Krenn				Diana Castanedo				Dr. Jorg Holzhuser				B R Sharma				Francisco Jose Gracia Pro				Hamed Moammeri Otorabad				Turker Arzu		
	Description	Max. Points	Revised Results	Earlier published results	Max. Points Claimed	Reference	Revised Results	Earlier published results	Max. Points Claimed	Reference	Revised Results	Earlier published results	Max. Points Claimed	Reference	Revised Results	Earlier published results	Max. Points Claimed	Reference	Revised Results	Earlier published results	Max. Points Claimed	Reference	Revised Results	Earlier published results	Max. Points Claimed	Reference	Max. Points obtained	Max. Points Claimed	Reference
I	General Qualification		25	25	25	25	25	20	25		25	25	25		20	20	0		20	20	20		25	25	25		20	20	
i)	Degree in Civil/ Mining Engineering		20	20	20	20	20	20	20		20	20	20		20	20			20	20	20		20	20	20		20	20	
ii)	Post Graduation in Design/Structural Engineering or equivalent		5	5	5	5	5	0	5		5	5	5		0	0			0	0	0		5	5	5		0	0	
II	Relevant Experience & Adequacy for the Project		70	56	59	55	44	54	70		54	68	68		59	67	0		70	70	70		63	61	61		68	68	
(a)	Total Professional Experience		10	8	8	8	16.64	8	0	10	15.39	8	10	10	16.97	10	10	40.55	10	10	10	25	9	9	9	20.94	10	10	27.38
	<15 years	0																											
	15-20 years	8																											
	>20 -25years	9																											
	>25years	10																											
(b)	Experience in Tunnel Projects		30	26	26	20	20	24	30		16	28	28		22	30	0		30	30	30		26	24	24		28	28	
	(i) Professional experience in handling major tunnel projects (Road/Rail/Metro)		10	10	10	10	15.15	10	8	10	14.62	10	10	10	14.97	10	10	20.98	10	10	10	19.39	10	10	10	20.94	10	10	27.38
	<10 years	0																											
	>=10-12 years	6																											
	>12 -14 years	8																											
	>14 years	10																											
	(ii) Experience in major* tunnel construction/construction supervision projects (Road/Rail/Metro)		10	10	10	10	19.35	10	8	10	14.62	0	10	10	4.92	6	10	10.38	10	10	10	19.09	8	8	8	15.99	8	8	12.21
	<10 years	0																											
	>=10-12 years	6																											
	>12 -14 years	8																											
	>14 years	10																											
	(iii)Experience in preparation of DPR or Feasibility report of major tunnel projects (Road/Rail/Metro)		10	6	6	0	10.58	0	8	10	0	6	8	8	10.05	6	10	10.6	10	10	10	19.38	8	6	6	12.78	10	10	15.18
	<10 years	0																											
	>=10-12 years	6																											
	>12 -14 years	8																											
	>14 years	10																											
c)	Experience in Similar Capacity		30	22	25	27	16	30	30		30	30	30		27	27	0		30	30	30		28	28	28		30	30	
	(i) Professional Experience as Tunnel Design Engineer (Structural)		8	8	6	8	15.15	8	8	8	14.62	8	8	8	14.97	8	7	20.98	8	8	8	23.88	8	8	8	20.94	8	8	27.38
	<8 years	0																											
	>=8-10 years	6																											
	>10 – 12 years	7																											
	>12 years	8																											
	(ii) Experience as Tunnel Design Engineer (Structural) of major tunnel construction/construction supervision projects (Road/Rail/Metro)		8	8	7	8	14.82	8	8	8	14.62	8	8	8	13.25	7	7	10.38	8	8	8	19.09	8	8	8	15.99	8	8	12.21
	<8 years	0																											
	>=8 – 10 years	6																											
	>10-12 years	7																											
	>12 years	8																											
	(iii) Experience as Tunnel Design Engineer (Structural) of major tunnel for preparation of DPR projects (Road/Rail/Metro)		7	0	7	5	4.78	0	7	7	0	7	7	7	13.38	6	7	10.6	7	7	7	19.38	6	6	6	12.78	7	7	15.18
	<8 years	0																											
	>=8 – 10 years	5																											
	>10-12 years	6																											
	>12 years	7																											
	(iv)Experience as Tunnel Design Engineer (Structural) in preparation of DPR/ Feasibility report of major tunnel projects (Road/Rail/Metro) using NATM		7	6	5	6	3 projects	0	7	7	0	7	7	7	6 projects	6	6	4 projects	7	7	7	9 projects	6	6	6	4 projects	7	7	5 projects
	< 3 projects	0																											
	>=3-5 projects	6																											
	5 or more projects	7																											
III	Employment with Firm		5	5	5		0	0	0		0	0	0		0	0	0		0	0	0		0	0	0		5	5	
	Less than 1 Year		0																										
	1-2 years	3																											
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum of 2 marks	5	5	5	5		0	0	0		0	0	0		0	0		0	0	0		0	0	0		5	5		
	Total		100	86	89	85	69	74	95		79	93	93		79	87	0		90	90	90		88	86	86		93	93	
			10	8.6	8.9	8.5	6.9	7.4	9.5		7.9	9.3	9.3		7.9	8.7	0		9	9	9		8.8	8.6	8.6		9.3		
Age on bid due date: Not more than 70 years.						DOB-14/6/1974 (45 years)				DOB-8/5/1979 (41 years)				DOB-21/05/1965 (55years)				DOB-17/09/1957 (63 years)				DOB-13/4/1967 (53 years)				DOB-07/06/1976 (43 years)			DOB-23/02/1967 (53 years)

### Similar Capacity for Team Leader cum Senior Tunnel Expert

i) On behalf of the Consultant/Contractor:

---

[illegible]

<p>* Major Tunnel Project = having length more than 1.5 km.</p> <p>Similar Capacity for SENIOR VENTILATION &amp; FIRE SAFETY EXPERT</p> <p>i) On behalf of the Consultant/Contractor: Senior Ventilation &amp; Fire Safety Expert</p> <p>ii) In Government Organizations: -Nil</p>
--







Directional Coring Expert																														
S.No.	Name of the Bidder →		GeoConsult India Pvt. Ltd. In JV with RITES Ltd.				Tec Cuatro S.A. In JV with ATC and in Association with AIA & Devico AS				Eptisa India Pvt Ltd in Association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.				SMEC International Pty. Ltd. In JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.				Subterra Engineering India Pvt Ltd. in Association with Space Engineers Consortium Pvt Ltd.				TPF Getinsa Eurostudios S.L.				ERKAS- Turkish Engg Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS in association with AVOK			
	Name of the KEY PERSONAL →		Subrata Kumar				Chris Wai Kay Tai				Arindom Ganguly				Eirik Borg				Sheikh Abdul Ahad				Christian Alejandro Monardez Arancibia				Neslihan Ozefe			
	Description	Max Marks	Revised Results	Earlier published results	Max. Points Claimed	Reference	Revised Results	Earlier published results	Max. Points Claimed	Reference	Revised Results	Earlier published results	Max. Points Claimed	Reference	Revised Results	Earlier publishe d results	Max. Points Claimed	Reference	Revised Results	Earlier publishe d results	Max. Points Claimed	Referenc e	Revised Results	Earlier published results	Max. Points Claimed	Reference	Max. Points obtained	Max. Points Claimed	Reference	
I	General Qualification	25	25	25	25		25	20	20		25	25	25		20	20	0		20	20	20		25	25	25		20	20		
	(i) Graduate in Engineering / science/drilling or equivalent	20	20	20	20		20	20	20		20	20	20		20	20			20	20	20		20	20	20		20	20		
	(ii) Post Graduation in drilling or equivalent	5	5	5	5		5	0	0		5	5	5		0	0			0	0	0		5	5	5		0	0		
II	Relevant Experience and Adequacy for the Project	70	46	62	62		55	70	70		70	66	70		70	70	0		29	40	70		70	70	70		46	70		
	a) Total Professional Experience	20	20	20	20		20	20	20		20	20	20		20	20			20	20	20		20	20	20		20	20		
	<10 Years - 0 marks 10-12 Years - 10 Marks >12-15 Years - 15 Marks >15 Years - 20 Marks					26.85				23.08				21.87				16				19.7				19.62			16.06	
	b) Experience in Relevant Works	50	26	42	42		35	50	50		50	46	50		50	50	0		9	20	50		50	50	50		26	50		
	(i) Professional experience in handling tunnel/mineral and oil exploration projects	12	12	12	12		9	12	12		12	12	12		12	12			9	12	12		12	12	12		12	12		
	<05 Years - 0 marks >=05-10 Years - 09 Marks >10-12 Years - 11 Marks >12 Years - 12 Marks					26.85				6.32				14.08				16				9.7				19.62			13.39	
	(ii) Experience in directional coring for tunneling projects	12	0	12	12		12	12	12		12	12	12		12	12			0	0	12		12	12	12		0	12		
	<1 project - 0 marks 1 Project - 08 Marks 2 or more projects- 12 Marks					0				7 projects				2 projects				4 projects				0				4 projects			0	
	(iii) Experience directional coring for tunnelling projects at an elevation above 1000 m	12	0	8	8		0	12	12		12	12	12		12	12			0	8	12		12	12	12		0	12		
	<1 project - 0 marks 1 Project - 08 Marks 2 or more projects- 12 Marks					0				0				2 projects				3 project				0				4 projects			0	
	(iv) Experience of directional coring/geotechnical investigation in more than one country	14	14	10	10		14	14	14		14	10	14		14	14			0	0	14		14	14	14		14	14		
	< 2 country - 0 marks 2 country - 10 Marks 3 country or more- 14 Marks					4 countries				> 3 countries				3 countries				> 3 countries				0				3 countries			3 countries	
III	Employment with the Firm < 1 year -0 marks 1-2 year -3 marks Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to	5	5	5	5		5	5	5		3.5	3.5	3.5		0	0			5	5	5		0	0	0		0	0		
	TOTAL	100	76	92	92		85	95	95		98.5	94.5	98.5		90	90			54	65	95		95	95	95		66	90		
		10	7.6	9.2	9.2		8.5	9.5	9.5		9.85	9.45	9.85		9	9			5.4	6.5	9.5		9.5	9.5	9.5		6.6			
Age on bid due date: Not more than 70 years.						DOB-24/10/1968 51 Years				DOB-24/10/1968 51 Years				DOB-24/10/1968 51 Years				DOB-24/10/1968 51 Years				DOB-13/9/1973 46 Years				DOB-19/10/1972 47 Years			DOB-26/10/1973 46 Years	

### Evaluation of Technical Proposals

**Project Name : Consultancy Services for Preparation of Detailed Project Report and providing Pre-Construction activities for Construction of Highway Tunnel including approaches across Shinkun La, Tanglang La & Lachalung La in the Union Territory of Ladakh**

#### Summary of evaluation of Technical Proposals

S. No.	Description	Maximum Marks	GeoConsult India Pvt. Ltd. In JV with RITES Ltd.	Tec Cuatro S.A. in JV with ATC and in Association with AIA & Devico AS	Eptisa India Pvt Ltd in Association with Eptisa Servicios De Ingenieria S.L.	SMEC International Pty. Ltd. in JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.	Subterra Engineering India Pvt Ltd. in Association with Space Engineers Consortium Pvt Ltd.	TPF Getinsa Eurostudios S.L.	ERKAS- Turkish Engg Consulting & Contracting-TUMAS in association with AVOK
1	Relevant experience for assignments	40	30	39	28	26	29.5	30	22
2	Material Testing, Survey and Investigation, Equipment and Software Proposed	10	9.75	10	9.5	9.75	8.75	9.5	8.75
3	Qualifications and relevant experience of the proposed key personnel	50	42.80	42.18	41.91	43.62	40.76	45.36	42.52
	Total marks	100	82.55	91.18	79.41	79.37	79.01	84.86	73.27
	Remarks		Eligible for opening of financial proposal	Eligible for opening of financial proposal	Eligible for opening of financial proposal	Eligible for opening of financial proposal	Eligible for opening of financial proposal	Eligible for opening of financial proposal	Eligible for opening of financial proposal